

State of New Jersey
 Department of Treasury
 Integrity Monitoring Reporting Model
 For Quarter Ending: 12/31/2014

Reports required under A-60 will be submitted by Integrity Monitors on the first business day of each calendar quarter to the State Treasurer and will contain detailed information on the projects/contracts/programs funded by the Disaster Relief Appropriations Act.

No.	Recipient Data Elements	Response	Comments
A. General Info			
1.	Recipient of funding	Elizabeth (Union)	
2.	Federal Funding Agency? (e.g. HUD, FEMA)	Federal Emergency Management Agency	
3.	State Funding (if applicable)	N/A	
4.	Award Type	Public Assistance - Category G	
5.	Award Amount	\$13,658,027.20	90% of total Project Cost of \$15,175,585.78 per FEMA Project Worksheet (PW) 2100007 (dated 11/10/2014).
6.	Contract/Program Person/Title	Veterans Memorial Waterfront Park	
7.	Brief Description, Purpose and Rationale of Project/Program	Due to high winds, heavy rains, subsequent flooding and storm surge from Superstorm Sandy, Elizabeth sustained major damage to its waterfront facilities known collectively as Veterans Memorial Waterfront Park. For the purposes of this PW, the waterfront site was divided into five (5) areas of focus: 1) Veterans Memorial Waterfront Park; 2) Municipal Marina; 3) Recreation Pier and Boardwalk Pier; 4) Hike, Bike and Roll Throughway to Slater Park; and 5) Atalanta Plaza.	
8.	Contract/Program Location	Elizabeth and Front Streets, Elizabeth, Union County	
9.	Amount Expended to Date	\$6,555,945.72	\$8,016,430.90 has been completed to date for all scopes, including \$1,460,485.18 of Non-FEMA reimbursable work.
10.	Amount Provided to other State or Local Entities	None	
11.	Completion Status of Contract or Program	48.00%	Percent complete is based on the total amount of FEMA reimbursable work.
12.	Expected Contract End Date/Time Period	June 30, 2015	
B. Monitoring Activities			
13.	If FEMA funded, brief description of the status of the project worksheet and its support.	The original PW was submitted on March 17, 2013. There have been two subsequent amendments. Amendment 1 amended certain insurance costs. Amendment 2 involves a change in scope of work and costs due to hidden damage involving rip-rap footings and to further mitigate the boardwalk with additional nailer boards. Amendment 3 was created to make changes to the Scope of Work and cost Estimate. The project worksheet stated that there may be a fourth amendment which would include costs associated with removing contaminated soil.	Since our last report there was one amendment (Amendment 3) added to the scope on 10/17/2014.
14.	Quarterly Activities/Project Description (include number of visits to meet with recipient and sub recipient, including who you met with, and any site visits warranted to where work was completed)	Thacher Associates' quarterly activities focused on continuing our comprehensive monitoring program described in previous quarterly reports. At the conclusion of the quarter, the Project mostly involved work on the fourth and last contract - installing rip rap along the shoreline north of the Recreation Pier. Thacher Associates conducted four (4) site visits in October, five (5) site visits in November, and three (3) site visits in December, led by either our Forensic Engineer, Investigator or both. At these visits Thacher Associates performed any combination of the following tasks: observe work in progress; perform worker headcounts; meet with contractor personnel to discuss status of project and process for assessing change order; photograph and document work performed to date and work currently being performed; and request and review relevant documentation (e.g., change order logs, sign-in sheets, request for information). These site visits occurred on October 14, 17, 24, and 31, November 5, 13, 17, 20 and 24, and December 12, 22, and 30. In addition, our staff attended a bid opening meeting to ensure procurement compliance and a pre-construction conference for the same project.	
15.	Brief Description to confirm appropriate data/information has been provided by recipient and what activities have been taken to review in relation to the project/contract/program.	Thacher Associates requested any and all documents related to procurement including City of Elizabeth Policies and Procedures manuals, bids submitted by contractors, bid tabulation sheets and insurance requirements. Additional requests were made regarding requisitions, payment vouchers, certified payroll reports and corresponding letters to contractors, and change order documentation.	Documentation has been timely provided by City of Elizabeth as well as by their Construction Manager and respective General Contractors.

State of New Jersey
 Department of Treasury
 Integrity Monitoring Reporting Model
 For Quarter Ending: 12/31/2014

Reports required under A-60 will be submitted by Integrity Monitors on the first business day of each calendar quarter to the State Treasurer and will contain detailed information on the projects/contracts/programs funded by the Disaster Relief Appropriations Act.

No.	Recipient Data Elements	Response	Comments
16.	Description of quarterly auditing activities that have been conducted to ensure procurement compliance with terms and conditions of the contracts and agreements.	Thacher Associates reviewed contracts awarded as well as bids submitted by other firms including the contract awarded to Envar Services Inc. and the Veterans Memorial Waterfront Park contract awarded to Tomco. We also attended the bid-opening for the fourth contract (Atalanta Plaza) and observed the procurement procedures as they were being conducted.	The bid package for the low bidder on the Atalanta Plaza contract included documentation that did not meet the contract requirements, and was therefore rejected.
17.	Have payment requisitions in connection with the contract/program been reviewed? Please describe	Thacher Associates performed a spot review of Tomco's Veterans Memorial Waterfront Project requisition #2 as of January 31, 2014 and identified two mathematical errors in the details of the requisition. Thacher Associates discussed this issue with City of Elizabeth who had already addressed those concerns resulting from an audit by the Office of Inspector General. The mathematical errors did not have any impact on the amounts paid to date or future payments. Thacher Associates performed a spot review of Scafar Contracting's requisition dated September 30, 2014 and supporting certified payroll reports without exception.	No other issues noted on reviewed requisitions. The City of Elizabeth continues to be expeditious and thorough with respect to any and all requests from Thacher Associates.
18.	Description of quarterly activity to prevent and detect waste, fraud and abuse.	Thacher Associates conducted regular site visits to the project site for the purposes of determining compliance with contractual and legal requirements and monitor for known integrity risks identified through our comprehensive risk assessment, including but not limited to prevailing wage, design specifications, and change order procedures. Thacher Associates also performed a variety of audit activities outlined in more detail in box 16 above.	
19.	Provide details of any integrity issues/findings	Our site interviews revealed two potential concerns - a prevailing wage violation and improper apprentice to journeyman ratios. Our review of both issues is still pending.	
20.	Provide details of any work quality or safety/environmental/historical preservation issue(s).	None.	
21.	Provide details on any other items of note that have occurred in the past quarter	None.	
22.	Provide details of any actions taken to remediate waste, fraud and abuse noted in past quarters	None.	
C. Miscellaneous			
23.	Attach a list of hours and expenses incurred to perform your quarterly integrity monitoring review	For the period of October 1, 2014, through December 31, 2014, Thacher Associates expended 221.50 hours at a cost of \$36,819.38. We had no expenses. A brief summary of the services provided include conducting approximately twelve (12) site visits and attending two other meetings (bid opening and pre-construction conference). Thacher Associates also filed monthly reports to the Department of Treasury for the months of September, October, and November and a quarterly report for the period of July through September 2014.	
24.	Add any item, issue or comment not covered in previous sections but deemed pertinent to monitoring program.	Previously reported prevailing wage underpayments for one subcontractor were rectified through the confirmation of back pay to workers.	

Name of Integrity Monitor: Thacher Associates LLC
 Name of Report Preparer: Joseph A. DeLuca
 Signature: *AL DeLuca*, COO
 Date: April 1, 2015